

Broughty Ferry Community Council

Minute of Ordinary Meeting held in Broughty Ferry Library on Tuesday 1st April 2025.

Meeting opened at 7.00pm

1. Community Councillors Present

Neil Cooney (Vice-Chair), James Doig (Secretary) David Easson (Treasurer), John Watson (Planning), Fiona Potton, Chris Johnson, Isobel McLean, George Laidlaw, Norma McGovern.

In Attendance

Nil

Ex-Officio

Bailie Derek Scott

Apologies

Doreen Phillips, Tara Javed, Charlie Delaney, Kenny Matheson, Molly Laidlaw, Lorna Murray, Christine Rea.

Members of the Public Present

Five members of the public were in attendance.

2. Minute of Previous Meeting (4th March 2025)

The draft minute (previously distributed) was agreed as a true minute, proposed by John Watson seconded by David Easson and agreed by the members present.

3. Matters Arising

Westfield Road Traffic Issues;

It was noted, residents of Westfield Road had not been consulted with regard to the traffic issues and the report produced was inaccurate. Residents will respond accordingly.

Update under (12- Matters raised by Community Councillors).

Broughty Ferry Castle & its Future;

Update from Planning Secretary; 'As 'Giving Back' has withdrawn from the discussions, a steering committee is being set up to explore how best to support Leisure & Culture Dundee, the meeting agreed that the Chair and Planning Secretary join that group. John has met with Broughty Ferry Traders to discuss support and the way forward for the castle being open in the longer term, hopefully by the end of the year.

New school crossing facility in Forthill Road.

Due to SGN works, council won't be able to complete the works on the build out until late March and will advise once complete (forwarded to members). Highlighting of build out bollard; Bollard is fully compliant for this type of use and already has the maximum sized reflectivity panels, the maximum reflectivity you can get and used throughout the city on similar road features.

Question asked if Brook Street is to be resurfaced this year, Bailie Scott will update us on receipt of the budget consultation report.

Update received from Bailie Scott, as stated in Secretary's correspondence, and forwarded to members.

SGN work; David Easson stated the online map shows Queen Street to be closed (at the library), but it was stated earlier the road would be one way westward.

It was also stated that due to the ongoing work, vehicles were using King Street/Westfield Road/Brook Street as a rat run to avoid queues elsewhere. These issues have not been addressed by DCC. Bailie Scott will check these points. Reply as stated in Secretary's correspondence.

4. Chairs Report

Chair Doreen submitted apologies for tonight's meeting; Ferry Fridge has paid for a stall on Gala day and are awaiting confirmation they have it. This is to raise awareness of the Fridge, which should be open before the end of June, and to fundraise for it, Donations for the tombola would be appreciated and can be collected at the May and June BFCC meetings if required.

5. Matters raised by Members of the Public (Previously intimated)

None received as per requirements, but concern regarding outdoor beer garden at Papa Jacques in Brook Street received this afternoon, to be discussed at AOCB.

6. Police Report

The Secretary had attended Longhaugh Police Station, but did not get an answer, followed up by phone call without success. sent an email to Police Scotland, reply received 8/2/2025 (Form: 04d-1a0e5825db3b) stating my email had been sent to the relevant department for attention/action and someone would be in contact in due course. Awaiting reply.

Further email sent to Police Scotland 16/093/2025, with same response. Await reply.

It was noted in Cllr Duncan's report, he had met with Chief Inspector Burns, Police Scotland Area Commander in Broughty Ferry. Secretary to contact Cllr Duncan regarding police reports for Community Council meetings.

7. Secretary's Report (Previously Distributed) Correspondence

05/03 Ref: SGN works in Queen Street from Bailie Scott (Fort Street to St,Vincent Street closed eastbound from Monday 10th March for 5 weeks). Monifieth Road (St Vincent Street to Abertay Street closed eastbound from Monday 7th April for 9 weeks). Monifieth Road (Abertay Street to St.Vincent Street closed westbound from Monday 16th June for 9 weeks).

06/03 Info from Christine regarding BFCC AGM, members meeting attendance and the Constitution requirement.

06/03 Draft letter of objection to the case officer from Planning secretary regarding the RBS building change of use.

07/03 Update from Bailie Scott regarding 2025/26 roads maintenance programme. (Part of Tom Johnston Road & Forthill Drive are to be resurfaced).

- 13/03 From DCC; 20mph zones, Charleston area, Dundee.
- 13/03 Update from Bailie Scott ref; Bollard at school crossing on Forthill Road.
Colour of bollard depends on availability & design engineers choice, all are required to be reflective during hours of darkness.
- 14/03 Info from John Watson; As a result of a meeting with Giving Back, DCC, LACD, HES & BFTA, Giving Back is to drop its proposal to save the castle & take no further part in the exercise.
- 16/03 Police Scotland; Further email sent regarding report with reply again stating, sent to relevant department.
- 17/03 Info from Dundee Action Group ref; 'SPEED' presentation slides & notice of "Resilience" event at V&A, 22/03/2025.
- 18/03 Update from Bailie Scott ref; 288 Brook Street (RBS), no breach of planning consent, as not required for internal works. DCC cannot control Royal Mail delivery system.
- 19/03 Email from BFCC member regarding ongoing 'Westfield Road Traffic Issues', to be discussed at item 12 on agenda.
- 27/03 From DCC, Community Council Elections are scheduled to take place in September 2025. Discussion regarding postponement of BFCC from May to September.
Update – The election of office bearers should proceed at the May AGM. Community Council elections will be in September, date to be advised.

Constitution:- If a member fails to attend or put in apologies for a period of three months, he/she shall be deemed to have left the Council.

Any member who fails to attend a minimum of five meetings per year shall be deemed to have demitted office.

Any person co-opted to the Council to fill a casual vacancy shall be asked to attend three meetings of the Council before being officially co-opted.

Following the information above, received (06/03/25) from DCC, regarding members attendance at meetings as stated in the constitution. Doug McLaren, who has not attended BFCC meetings since June 2024 is deemed to have left the position as a Broughty Ferry Community councillor.

In discussion with Christine Rea, email sent to Doug regarding the decision, reason, and thanking him for his time and input during his time as Community Councillor.

It was noted at the meeting that Doug has had health problems, we wish him well and passed on our regards.

8. Planning Report 3rd – 28th February 2025 (Previously Distributed)

Of the 15 planning and 36 tree applications validated and examined during this period, none required attention.

24/00332/FULL – 182 Long Lane, erection of dwelling – Local Review Body.

The LRB met on 11th March to consider an appeal against the refusal of this application, which BFCC had supported and provided further observations to the LRB. The Board deferred any decision until a site visit had been completed. Advice on the date and time of the visit are awaited and BFCC expect to be given the opportunity to attend.

At the meeting it was intimated a site visit has been arranged for this Thursday 03/04/25 at 2.45pm.

**24/00246/LBC and 24/00247/FULL – 3 Albert Road, Broughty Ferry, Dundee DD5 1AY.
Conversion of building to form 13 No. self-catering apartments and events space.**

Dundee City Council's Planning Committee considered these applications earlier and approved listed building consent. The full planning application was refused by a narrow vote. That decision has been appealed,. And the matter will be considered by the Scottish Government in due course. It should be noted that the decision was not a delegated one but made by the committee and therefore the appeal cannot be considered by the Local Review Body and must be referred to Ministers.

Cabmen's Shelter, Gray Street, Broughty Ferry, Dundee

Members are reminded that the question of the above being a listed 'C' building arose at BFCC's regular meeting in May 2024. It was noted then that the statement of significance provided the reason for listing being its 'crucial' role in development of the transport system in Broughty Ferry. The meeting at that time agreed that the use of the word 'crucial' could not be justified and felt that its listing status should be removed. However, at that time negotiations were taking place between DCC and a newly established local charity 'Ferry Fridge' to lease the building, introducing the potential delisting process would have caused delay so such action was put on hold. Those negotiations have now been completed and the lease agreed allowing an application to delist the building to be completed and sent by the Planning Secretary to Historic Environment Scotland on 19th March with the Chair's consent and approval. The decision could take many months and is likely to involve a site visit by HES in due course as part of the process. The Planning Secretary will advise members of the content of the application at their April meeting.

Former Royal Bank of Scotland office building, Brook Street, Broughty Ferry.

At its regular meeting on 4th March a planning application to change the use of the former Royal Bank of Scotland building in Brook Street, Broughty Ferry, was considered. The report by the planning secretary on the application previously circulated, was brief and neutral.

Members of the public attending were given the opportunity to speak to the application and there was much concern expressed about the effect change of use would have on the wellbeing of the immediate community. The meeting decided to object to the application and instructed the planning secretary accordingly. As a result, he visited the site on Wednesday 5th March to form an accurate opinion of the circumstances on behalf of BFCC which led to the following response in the form of a letter of objection being sent to the case officer. The response was circulated and its content approved by email replies.

To Sharon Dorward

**24/00757/ADV – Advertisement of the following types: fascia sign and window vinyl's.
25/00088/FULL – Change of use of former bank (class 1a) to cocktail bar and lounge (sui generis) and associated external alterations.**

Both applications refer to 288 Brook Street, Broughty Ferry, Dundee DD5 2AP.

This Community Council noted **24/00757?ADV** validated on 6th January 2025 and awaited an application relating to 288 Brook Street which, if approved, would give reason for this one.

This proved to be an appropriate position to take when **25/00088/FULL** was validated on 19th February 2025 and drafting of a preliminary response to it began for BFCC to consider at its 4th March meeting. It was with some surprise therefore to learn that the **24/00757/ADV** had been approved on 27th February before **25/00088/FULL** had been decided. This gave rise to some confusion and resulted in many members of the public attending BFCC's meeting of 4th March to express their dismay that it appeared a 'change of use' had been decided without proper consultation.

After much discussion BFCC gave assurance that it had listened carefully to the concerns expressed and would reflect them in its response to application **25/00088/FULL** to the Case Officer before the end of the consultation period.

Regarding the decision on **24/00757/ADV**, the Report of Handling by Appointed Officer dated 26th February 2025 under **Description of Proposal**, the fourth paragraph refers to **25/00088/FULL** and states '*However, the development proposed in the application for planning permission is not for consideration as part of this application (ADV – Ed.) and only the signage is for consideration here*'. It is to be regretted that the decision could not have been put on hold until that of the change of use application was known.

Turning now to BFCC's consideration of **25/00088/FULL**

The application site is within the Broughty Ferry Conservation Area (2014).

The applicant's agent, Wilson/Paul, attached a **Planning Application Supporting Statement** to the application, which provides the clear purpose of the application:

- . Conversion of the former ground floor bank area to form a boutique cocktail bar/lounge with an open bar area and VIP lounge seating areas.
- . Includes a large car parking area to the south with 7 car parking spaces.
- . Back of house facilities include space for small cooking appliances such as a microwave or grill, with space for storage of small 'bar' type dishes and snacks.
- . A small kitchen area to provide the 'bar' type meals.
- . Retain the existing fire escape point to the south elevation, a new 1200mm width corridor to provide direct access for 2 means of escape.
- . Opening hours 11am to 12 midnight.
- . It is not proposed **at this stage** to provide any outdoor seating.

It states that '*The premises has flatted residential accommodation at first floor level (1 flat), accessed via stairs located at the rear (south) elevation of the building.*' It fails to reveal that these premises are and have been owner occupied for more than the past 25 years and shares the entry passage from Brook Street to the car park at the rear. This is not shown on the proposed site plan. Neither is it admitted that the proposed fire escape point (emergency exit) to the south elevation exits directly to private ground owned by the first floor and is not part of the old bank curtilage.

In examining this application, it is important to reflect upon how the site operated as a bank for at least the past 25 years. Generally, the working hours would be between 8am (or later) and 5pm (or earlier), Monday to Friday, which equates to a maximum of 45 working hours per week and all during the recognized working day.

The number employed would never have exceeded 10 and the operation serving the public was conducted in a regulated, noiseless environment, thus providing the residents of the first floor flat and those in the adjacent properties to the east, south and west with relative peace and comfort outside and indeed within those working hours.

The proposal is to have opening hours between 11am and midnight which will require an hour each end for preparing /closing. Assuming that the intention is to be open 7 days per week then it will be active for 15 hours/day, 7 days/week = 105 hours/week, 56 of which will be after the normal working day.

By simple arithmetic, the proposal would create an additional 69 hours/week activity beyond that of the past within and without the premises including activity in the rear car park, potentially to 1am each morning. In comparison to the bank operation the noise level in the cocktail/bar and open lounge area, VIP lounges will permeate upwards into the apartment above and create an unacceptable living environment over that which had been before. The vehicular traffic to and from the car park at the rear will increase beyond all proportion to what had been before and potentially be used until the early hours of the morning creating unacceptable conditions for those residents living adjacent.

It is known that the first floor is owned and occupied by a family of seven, including one 94-year old lady, another member suffers from health difficulties and there are school-age children. While this may not be a factor when assessing this application, the increased activity in the ground floor below and in the outdoor surround that would be introduced should the application be granted would have a dramatic effect on the mental health and well-being of the occupants through noise generation and potential anti-social behaviour, particularly during the hours of darkness.

It is of great concern to the residents of adjoining properties to the east, south and west of 288 Brook Street that should the change of use be granted it would encourage a huge increase in anti-social behaviour, already at an unacceptable level. The change proposed is substantial and risks relating to use, noise, hours of opening, environmental controls and overlooking are real.

It is known that the property was marketed by a Dundee property management company on a 'To Let' basis and may have been let to the applicant sometime after it was vacated by the Royal Bank of Scotland at the end of 2023. There is no evidence of any attempt being made either by the property management company or the applicant to consult by means available on what a change of use would be considered reasonable by the community and, importantly, by those living nearby. The **Planning Support Statement** attached to the application makes no mention of whether the applicant did make any contact with residents adjacent to the property to gauge reaction before making the application. This has added to the discomfort demonstrated by local residents at the BFCC meeting of 4th March 2025.

The local feelings against this application are strong, not only for the reasons provided in this response, but also, against what the community perceives as the assumption that a liquor licence would be granted as a matter of form. The members of the public attending and the overall view of the community council at its meeting was that this was by no means certain, because the immediate area is already saturated by licensed premises and any additional liquor license application would be vigorously opposed.

Broughty Ferry Community Council to protect the health, security, and well-being of its community object in the strongest possible terms to this application.

As there were anti-social behaviour problems in the Brook Street area, Bailie Scott to contact the anti-social behaviour team and police Scotland to provide additional patrols in the area.

At the meeting, Planning Secretary John was thanked for the thorough investigation carried out regarding the above application.

9. Licensing Report.

No applications had been received by the secretary during this period, or for the past few months. Bailie Scott stated he would forward future application report's to the secretary.

10. Public Relations Report

Short talk on St James church building (Future & Availability) by Rev Lorna Tunstall.

Rev Tunstall will be one of two ministers located in Broughty Ferry, she gave an update on the radical changes required to maintain the church in Broughty Ferry. There are presently 5 churches (St. Lukes, Queen St. East, St. James & Barnhill St.Margarets) with St. Stephens & West deferred as it presently has a resident minister.

It is evident they will be unable to maintain all of the buildings. St. Lukes, St. James & St. Stephens & West are all 'B' listed by the Church of Scotland which require to be either sold, let, or disposed of, with St. Lukes being marketed for sale by the end of the year. There was a general discussion with regard to St. James and its long history & association with Broughty Ferry and the RNLI, could it be divided up, used as a community space, can it have another use (Dundee tapestry for example). While it was agreed it should be retained, the Church of Scotland requirements are , it should be disposed of as stated previously.

11. Beach Management Report

Deferred to the next meeting.

12. Matters Raised by Community Councillors

Westfield Road and Broughty Ferry Traffic Issues, raised by George Laidlaw and residents. Westfield Road Traffic Issues – Residents have still to receive a response from DCC after waiting a year and no meeting was ever arranged with interested parties as requested.

Broughty Ferry Traffic Issues – Draft paper distributed regarding the many issues which may have been missed and details which may not be necessary.

Discussion on these issues deferred to the next BFCC meeting, and to look at the whole problem in central Broughty Ferry, possibility with an independent traffic management team and other stakeholders to discuss survey options.

DCC are awaiting a decision from Network Rail regarding electrification of the east coast line through Broughty Ferry which will have an impact on traffic issues, they will not make a decision until that is decided.

13. Contributions from Elected Members

Bailie Derek Scott's Report;

At the last meeting I was asked to investigate the following issues; Bollard at Forthill Road, Internal works at 288 Brook Street, Timescale for neighbour notification letters to be issued, The Councils 2025/26 roads capital programme and the Traffic management for the SGN phase of works between Fort Street and St. Vincent Street.

I provided responses to these to the secretary. In respect of the roads capital programme Forthill Drive is listed as having the internal circulatory carriageway and entrance bellmouth resurfaced. I asked officers if they could also include the stretch of carriageway between these two sections as it is where the sheltered complex is located and they agreed to do so.

I held a site meeting at Fairfield Road with officers from the council's traffic and transport team about speeding and congestion in the street when matches are taking place at Dawson Park. The situation will continue to be monitored and consideration is to be given to promoting double yellow lines at the junction with Arbroath Road.

I requested a clean-up of the car park in Brook Street. There has been a bit of rubbish dumping going on at the recycling bins. The clean-up has been done and hopefully it will stay that way for a while.

I was asked if a few more litter bins could be positioned on the route pupils take from Esso Express on Dalhousie Road back to Monifieth High School, particularly at the spots where they stop to consume their lunch purchases. A bin has been sited on Navarre Street at Guthrie Terrace and I have asked for some more to be strategically positioned.

Pupils tend to use the bins for their rubbish, it seems to be the gulls which are the culprits.

SGN has made a significant amendment to its current mains gas pipe renewal along the A930.

Monifieth Road (at Abertay Street) – temporary traffic lights Monday 31st March 2025 for 2 weeks.

Monifieth Road (Seabourne Gardens to Panmure Street) – no restrictions Monday 14th April for 4 weeks.

Monifieth Road (Panmure Street to St. Vincent Street) – closed west bound Monday 12th May for 3 weeks.

Essentially, once the current section is completed the only remaining closure left on the A930 scheme is on Monifieth Road between Panmure Street and St. Vincent Street. This will still use a diversion of Abertay Street/Nursery Road/Forthill Road/Fort Street.

Arrangements were to be made to have the kiddie car and crazy golf facilities at Castle Green open from the beginning of April. It was very disappointing that these weren't available last year.

Cllr Craig Duncan's Report;

Police meeting; Early in March I arranged to meet with Chief Inspector Burns the new Dundee Local Policing Area Commander in Broughty Ferry police station and we had a really useful conversation regarding local matters requiring police involvement, such as speeding, shoplifting, youth disorder and I made several suggestions which she has taken under consideration but we were both agreed upon the vital importance of building and cultivating links between the police and the local community.

Crazy Golf and Kiddie Karts; Last year I made it quite clear in public that I and many residents were deeply disappointed that neither of these two attractions were available on Castle Green last year and I have been pressing for assurances that these will be restored and I am pleased to say that I have received confirmation that they will be available this year.

Dawson Park Cherry Blossom Walk; In Recent years I have been pressing the council to adopt a 'succession planning' policy to ensure that this beautiful attraction popular far beyond Broughty Ferry is not lost due to a combination of aging and in some cases unhealthy trees being lost to storm damage and I am Delighted to report that the council has now confirmed to me that will monitor the health of existing trees and will shortly begin a program of planting new trees to ensure that this wonderful spectacle continues in future years.

Bus Shelters; I have been in frequent touch with the council regarding the multiple instances of bus shelter lighting not working and am assured that this will be addressed which I certainly welcome as I think that people need to be encouraged rather than deterred from public transport.

Castle Green Wall and Railings Damage; I am grateful to residents who have drawn my attention to significant damage to parts of the wall and railings at Castle Green on Castle Approach and I have received assurances from the council that this will be investigated and actioned as appropriate.

Faded Road Markings; I am pleased to see that several faded road markings in Forthill Road have recently been refreshed as these are only a few of similarly badly faded markings which I have asked to be refreshed.

Westfield Road Issues; I replied to the author of the multiply addressed email of 19th March saying I would be happy to help / discuss if the author or indeed any other resident of Westfield Road gets in touch with me directly but I have received no response but remain disposed to assist if required and actually approached directly.

14. AOCB

Late addition from member of the public:- Papa Jacques Beer Garden, outside hospitality. Planning Secretary intimated an application for an outside beer garden was refused 4 years ago, and visited today, noting a new fence has been erected to the east of the building. BFCC has not changed its status with regard to previous objection. Bailie Scott will contact the relevant department to check the current position.

Date of next meeting;

The next Ordinary Meeting will be held on Tuesday 6th May 2025 at 7.30pm (following the AGM) in Broughty Ferry Library.