



John J Watson
Planning Secretary
39 Elie Avenue
Broughty Ferry
Dundee DD5 3SF

Planning Report 30th March – 1st May 2020

Of the 10 planning and 3 tree applications examined during the above period one required attention.

Claire Myles
Planning Officer
City Development Department
Dundee House – Floor 6
North Lindsay Street
Dundee
DD5 3SF

27th April 2020

Dear Claire Myles,

**Planning Applications 20/00205/FULL and 20/00206/LBC
Partial Demolition of Listed Building and Erection of 3 No. Dwellinghouses.
383 Brook Street, Broughty Ferry, Dundee. DD5 2DS**

This site has been the subject of planning applications in 2012 and 2014, both of which were refused. In the current application form it is recorded that a pre-application discussion with Planning Officer Claire Myles had taken place and referred to a document **16/00977/FULL** as the basis of such discussion. This is a planning application reference which does not appear in the Planning Department's web site and therefore cannot be referred to when the current application is examined by third parties.

First impression when examining the proposals is that the townhouse structure fits reasonably well with the current building at 173 St Vincent Street and links to the development proposals for the listed cottage. However, the architect seems to have ignored the content of its own design and

access statement wherein Section 2.0., Heritage Asset and Context, it rightly provides the definition of a Conservation Area as: *An area of special architectural or historic interest, the character or appearance of which it is desirable to preserve and enhance.*

The keystone to the success or otherwise of these applications will lie on whether demolition of the large stone and slate northern section of the listed cottage is approved. It is important that Broughty Ferry Community Council (BFCC) ensures that its community is aware of the significance of a 'C' listed building in Scotland in that regard. It is *not* a building of *National* importance, it is *not* a building of *Regional* importance, but **it IS a building of Local importance.** The 'C' listed cottage and its curtilage lies within the Broughty Ferry Conservation Area (2014) and is recognized as a building of local importance and therefore must enjoy the protection that status provides. A fact the applicant chooses to ignore is that the whole of the building, not just a part, is of local importance. Nowhere in the applicant's design and access statement is that fact mentioned. Nowhere in that same statement is there any evidence provided that the northern section is in such a physical condition that demolition is the only option. Nowhere is any evidence provided that every effort has been made to explore development options that include this northern section. Nowhere is it recognized the significance of the importance of the historic building line that the historic cottage provides between Brook Street and St Vincent Street within the Broughty Ferry Conservation Area (2014).

The absence of evidence of the pre-application discussion between the applicant and the planning authority is a matter of concern, however, BFCC will always direct its efforts to protect its conservation areas from unsympathetic developments and these proposals do nothing to either protect the character or enhance the appearance of this historic section of the Broughty Ferry Conservation Area (2014).

That being the case, BFCC's view would preclude any comment regarding application **20/00205/FULL.**

Broughty Ferry Community Council's view is that it objects in the strongest possible terms to planning application 20/00206/LBC and wishes to see it withdrawn at the earliest opportunity.

John J Watson
Planning Secretary
27th April 2020

A draft of the above letter of objection was circulated to members as BFCC's preliminary view, responses received back by 27th April indicated that a majority were in favour of its content. It was therefore forwarded to the planning officer dealing with the application as BFCC's formal view.

JJW
2nd May 2020