



John J Watson
 Planning Secretary
 39 Elie Avenue
 Broughty Ferry
 Dundee DD5 3SF

Planning Report 6th to 31st January 2020

Of the 14 planning and 2 tree applications examined during the above period, one required comment and two received attention sufficient to report back to the Community Council because they form part of the past history of Broughty Ferry and members should be aware of the development intentions of both sites. There is no reason to make formal comment to the Planning Authority regarding these latter proposed developments.

The following comment has been sent to the planning department:

Siobhan Johnson
 Case Officer
 City Development Department
 Dundee House
 50 North Lindsay Street
 Dundee
 DD1 1LS

24th January 2020

Dear Siobhan Johnson,

20/00016/FULL – Land South of Dunalistair Gardens, Broughty Ferry, Dundee. New Single Storey House

This application was validated on Friday 10th January and examination of it is complex given the intended building site. It borders on to Hill Street to the south, it forms a part of the natural green environment that is unique to this part of the Forthill Conservation Area, it is steep and introduces factors regarding health and safety to the immediate vicinity of Hill Street should the application be approved. This may be seen to be beyond the scope of this Community Council's formal considerations, however, the southern boundary of the site is formed by a high stone wall that, in fact, prevents land slip from the site directly on to Hill Street and has done so since its construction more than 100 years ago. Today its physical state should be investigated. There is nothing in the application that indicates this has been done or indeed to recognize the risks associated with the structure.

The design of the proposed dwelling conflicts substantially with the historic architecture of the surrounding area. The application attempts to use an example of an approved application for a similarly designed residence currently under construction to the east and beyond the boundary

of the Forthill Conservation Area as evidence of why the design should be considered as being appropriate for the site. There is absolutely no similarity between the two sites and the design of the proposed dwelling conflicts dramatically with those around the site in all directions. There is also an overlooking issue that, although visited positively in the application, will directly affect those residences south of Hill Street and adjacent to the proposed site.

The grounds surrounding Dunalistair House have been developed over the past years and contain relatively modern dwellings of a design that merges into the environment, these are situated further up the hill to become almost invisible from the south. The proposed dwelling cannot be screened in the same manner and will be visible from the south to, as has already been stated, conflict dramatically with the surrounding historical environment. It does nothing to conserve and protect this sensitive part of the Forthill Conservation Area.

Broughty Ferry Community Council's preliminary view is that it objects to planning application 20/00016/FULL

Planning application 19/00964/FULL – Change of use of Hotel Broughty Ferry to eight two bedroom flats and associated external alterations.

This is brought to member's attention because of its situation within the Grove Conservation Area. It is not a listed building but commands a significant site on the western corner of the junction of West Queen Street and Westfield Road. A copy of the proposed alterations will be available at the February meeting. There is nothing in the proposals that warrant further comment except perhaps that it is good that the proposed works conserve the building for the longer term.

Planning application 19/00967/FULL – 8 Dalhousie Road, Broughty Ferry, Dundee. – Demolition of existing building and redevelopment for a 70 bed care home and associated open space, car parking and infrastructure.

This application refers to the ground currently occupied by the not insignificant Cambustay Hotel in terms of landmarks in The Ferry. The redevelopment was first rumoured during 2018 and confirmed when the application was validated on the 14th of January 2020. The internal of the building has undergone many changes over the past years to cater for the bar and restaurant trade but is said to be no longer viable. A copy of the proposals will be made available at the meeting.

Planning application 19/00186/FULL – Land to the north of Arbroath Road and east of Tom Johnson Road West Pitkerro Industrial Estate.

This is the site where it was proposed a new Aldi store be developed. Planning permission was refused in September 2019 and an appeal lodged in December. Advice has been received from the Planning and Environmental Appeals Division of the Scottish Government that a Reporter has now been appointed and will be carrying out an inspection of the appeal site. Up to the time of the decision in September 2019 the application contained just over 30 supporting documents. During the appeal preparation this has risen to 169, many of those added have been letters of support.

**Planning application 19/00799/FULM – Residential development of 100 dwellings with associated infrastructure, landscaping, drainage and open space.
Linlathen Village, Linlathen Road, Broughty Ferry, Dundee.**

This application was recommended for approval by the Planning Department of DCC.

It was considered at the City Development Committee on Monday, January 20th 2020. It was refused by Councillors by 17 votes to 6.

The reasons for refusal are:

1. The proposed development would exacerbate existing capacity issues within local infrastructure and community facilities such as health care and education. The applicant has also failed to provide adequate public transport provision and community shops and services in the immediate area for use by the residents of the proposed houses. The proposed development would therefore not integrate with any existing community infrastructure and fails to provide new community infrastructure. The application fails to comply with Policy 2 of TAYplan 2016 - 2036. There are no material considerations of sufficient weight to justify approval of the application.
2. The proposed residential development is in excess of 400 metres from existing public transport provision and would not provide convenient links to services such as schools and shops. The proposal therefore fails to minimise the need to travel by private car. The associated increase in vehicle movements to and from the site would have an adverse impact on the capacity of the local road network, result in additional congestion and be to the detriment of road, cyclist and pedestrian safety. The application therefore fails to comply with Policy 54 of the Dundee Local Development Plan 2019. There are no material considerations of sufficient weight to justify approval of the application.

The credit for this result lies firmly at the feet of local elected members and they are to be applauded. Capacity issues within local infrastructure is a major concern when such developments are considered as is developer contribution towards their provision.

John J Watson
Planning Secretary
31st January 2020