

Broughty Ferry Community Council

Minute of the meeting held at Broughty Ferry Library on 6th November 2018

1. Community Councillors Present: Hugh Begg (Vice Chair), John Watson (Planning Secretary), David Easson (Treasurer), Stan Nutt (Licensing Secretary), Fiona Margaret Potton, Charlie Delaney, Jack Greenway, Carolyn Forrester, Isobel McLean

In Attendance: Natalie Mackland (DCC Communities Officer);

Ex Officio: Bailie Derek Scott; Councillor Craig Duncan.

Members of the Public Present: Jane Begg, J C Forrester, Doug McLaren

Apologies: Adele McGrath; Joan Chalmers, Councillor Philip Scott

2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Community Council

Item 11, reference made to parking issues in Fettercairn area. For the avoidance of doubt this should read Fettercairn Drive.

Subject to above amendment, these were agreed to be a true record.

Proposed by: Carolyn Forrester

Seconded by: John Watson

3. Matters arising from the approved Minutes:

1: Co-option

Vacancies advertised via email and social media. One person made contact with John expressing interest but no further progress. David Easson pointed out that community councillors cannot hold office if co-opted so filling vacancies may require an alternative approach.

2: Action Plan sub committee

Discussed under AOCB

3: BT Telephone Box

Stan did not manage to attend the most recent traders meeting to discuss but will attend the next meeting in November. All agreed that BFCC is willing to co-operate but must avoid all financial commitment.

4. Chair's Report

In Adele's absence, Hugh read the chair's report which had been circulated to Community Councillors.

Specific mention of James Mullen's attendance in December to outline the proposed flood protection works and maintenance plan at the Dunes along the Esplanade. James to be asked to provide his input and relevant plans 5 days in advance of the meeting.

All urged to consult the DCC website to consider flood risk management and scheme of flood prevention. Plans also available at the library counter.

5. Police Report

No report, no Police Scotland Representative present.

6. Secretary's Report

Reference made to Broughty in Bloom fundraiser, Friday 9th November from 2pm in YMCA. All proceeds towards 2019 plants.

7. Treasurer's Report

David advised of a minor amendment, total in the bank is £1,369.17.

8. Planning Report

Planning Secretary's Report 1st October – 2nd November 2018

Of the 13 Planning and 4 Tree Applications examined during this period one deserved attention This related to Planning Reference: **18/00800/FULL – Land to the rear of 182 Long Lane, Broughty Ferry – Proposed erection of a single house etc.**

This site falls within the **Broughty Ferry Conservation Area (2014)** and was the subject of a failed planning application and review request in 2014 and 2015. Examination of this new application showed no material differences to that refused in 2014. The attached preliminary view of this Council is in the form of a letter of **objection** sent to the Case Officer. It requires to be ratified or otherwise.

Dundee City Council Local Development Plan 2. The Reporter has concluded his review of the Plan which will shortly be placed before Dundee City Council for adoption. It is best that Hugh Begg, our learned Member on the subject of planning, provides the meeting with his words of wisdom regarding this Council's earlier submission and the content of what will be the final document.

Planning Permission Appeal: Linlathen, Linlathen Road, Broughty Ferry, Dundee. DD5 3NX

I received a letter from the Planning and Environmental Appeals Division of the Scottish Government informing of a site inspection of the appeal area by the Reporter appointed to consider the case was scheduled to take place on Thursday 25th October 2018 at 10:30. It contained an invitation to attend. Members are aware that BFCC at its October meeting decided it was content to await the Government's decision in due course, I therefore did not attend the site meeting.

Craig Swankie
Case Officer
City Development Department
Dundee City Council
Dundee House
North Lindsay Street
Dundee
DD1 1LS

1st November 2018

Dear Craig Swankie,

18/00800/FULL – Land to the rear of 182 Long Lane, Broughty Ferry, Dundee Proposed erection of single house with associated garden ground and parking.

This site lies within the **Broughty Ferry Conservation Area (2014)** and was the subject of Application **14/00686/FULL – Erection of 1.5 Storey House in Garden Ground to the Rear of 182 Long Lane, Broughty Ferry, Dundee.** This application was refused with the date of the Refusal Notice given as 18th December 2014. A Review, **Reference: LR 02/2015** of the decision was requested and the Local Review Body considered the request at its meeting on 21st April 2015 and at a subsequent site visit on the 11th May 2015. At its meeting on 19th May 2015 Dundee City Council's Local Review Body upheld the determination of the Appointed Officer and **REFUSED** the application for review.

In brief the main reasons for refusal then were:

1. The scale, massing and design of the proposed house is alien and incongruous to the existing New Road Streetscape and surrounding **Broughty Ferry Conservation Area**. The proposal fails to preserve that appearance and character of the **Broughty Ferry Conservation Area**. There are no material considerations that would justify approval of the application contrary to the provisions of the Local Development Plan.
2. The proposed development will remove the off-street parking facilities serving the original house at 182 Long Lane to the detriment of that property's amenity. It will also lead to an increase in in-street parking in the area surrounding the application site to the detriment of the amenity of the area given existing issues of on-street parking pressures and congestion. Therefore the development is contrary to the requirements of Policy 12 and Policy 50 of the Dundee Local Development Plan.
3. By virtue of the location, scale, design and massing of the proposed house the original house at 182 Long Lane will be obscured from view, adversely impacting the intended southern outlook of this property to the detriment of its amenity as well as the appearance of the New Road streetscape. In addition, the resulting area of private useable garden ground serving the original house will be at a level that is out of scale with the house. Therefore, the proposed house will adversely impact on the amenity of the original house and the character of the **Broughty Ferry Conservation Area**. The proposal is contrary to Policies 12 and 50 of the Dundee Local Development Plan. There are no other material considerations that would justify laying aside the provisions of the Local Development Plan to grant planning permission.

Broughty Ferry Community Council having studied this new application (18/00800/FULL), must revert back to the reasons for the refusal, and indeed the upholding of that decision after review, of application 14/00686/FULL.

Reason 1. The content of this still stands good today.

Reason 2. The off-road car parking facility on the south west of the proposed site is shown only able to accept three cars. The Appendix 3 of the DLDP states that one space should be provided within a new build but where there are on-street parking problems, an additional space should be provided within the curtilage of each house. In other words, 4 spaces are required to be provided within this site and not the congested three as drawn

The proposal of having a shared car parking site with a pathway serving 182 Long Lane is a crude attempt to seek a solution to preserve the original house's amenity *which it fails to do*.

Reason 3. The content of this speaks volumes and still holds good today.

It is understood by Broughty Ferry Community Council that each planning application must be considered on its own merit. However, this is an occasion where the past history of planning applications relating to this site cannot be ignored and it urges the planners to protect the character of the **Broughty Ferry Conservation Area (2014)** and take note of the content of Dundee City Council's Local Review Body's detailed Review Report of 19th May 2015 that refused the application to review, when considering the current application.

Broughty Ferry Community Council's Preliminary view is that it OBJECTS strongly to Planning Application 18/00800/FULL in order to protect the character of the Broughty Ferry Conservation Area (2014).

The Community Councillors ratified the Planning Report, proposed by Fiona M Potton, seconded by Carolyn Forrester.

Local Development Plan Review

Hugh Begg referred to the paper agreed by the Community Council Local Development Plan Review in September 2017 setting out our views on the Local Development Plan Review. He then spoke to a paper providing commentary on the treatment of the Community Council's observations by the City Council and, thereafter the Reporters who had reported to the City Council on 9 October 2018. The Members noted with approval the following conclusions: Broughty Ferry Community Council welcomes the brevity and clarity of the Proposed Local Development Plan. It continues the journey towards a document which is user friendly to all parties, including the residents of Broughty Ferry, and aims to deliver desirable outcomes in a manner which is efficient and effective as well as fair to all concerned. We are disappointed that not all of our observations have been taken on board to be acted upon. However, this is not the end of the story: plan making is a continuing process and we will remain vigilant in our attempts to ensure that policy making and subsequent development management are undertaken in the best interests of Broughty Ferry.

9. Licensing Report

No requests for Licenses or for variations have been received.

10. Matters raised by Community Councillors

A number of concerns were raised about litter and street cleanliness, specifically Brook Street carpark, a request for a Christmas day street cleaning route and general collection of litter from bins, many of which seem to be over filled. A small sub group, Jack Greenway, Fiona Potton and Carolyn Forrester to prepare a short paper for consideration, detailing the perceived issue and suggested solutions.

Issue raised about acoustics of the meeting venue, suggested use of a sound system and an altered seating arrangement which would help.

11. Contributions from Elected Members (ex officio members)

Cllr Duncan: Craig updated the meeting in the wake of the recent fire at the Post Office facility in Barnhill (Campfield Square) and informed the meeting that information from the Post Office is that a reopening before Christmas is uncertain but that they are totally committed to a long term Post Office presence in Barnhill.

Additionally he advised that he met last month with the Police Scotland Dundee Divisional Commander Andrew Todd in Police H.Q. in Bell Street. A very worthwhile meeting which gave him the opportunity to express disappointment with the recent redeployment of one of the Ferry's dedicated Community Policing Officers to general response duties, which clearly

restricts the ability of police to attend meetings such as BFCC. More positively he welcomed his suggestion that good use could be made of Broughty Ferry Police Station by holding regular "Open Day / Drop In" sessions e.g. a [Saturday morning](#) but crucially on a regular basis which locals could rely upon as an informal opportunity to access the station at a regular time and speak face to face with officers familiar with the Ferry.

Lastly he mentioned that he had a site visit this week with Council Officers and Friends of Barnhill Rock Garden to take forward the need to replace existing accommodation units there and that the meeting was very positive indeed with agreement in principle subject to detail and time lines which he shall certainly keep an eye on.

Baillie Scott: Derek provided an update on the damaged wall mentioned by Joan Chalmers at the previous meeting. He had reported it to the City Engineer who arranged for its immediate inspection and warning tape was applied. The premises to the east of the wall is a gas governor housing and Scottish Gas Networks were advised and it erected safety barriers. SGN believes the council has ownership of part of the wall and title information was to be checked. SGN put an advertising banner on the barriers which obscured the sign directing vehicles to Queen Street Car Park and Derek asked for this to be removed.

A site meeting was held with officers from the Neighbourhood Services Department at the recycling bins located at the wide junction at Dundee Road bridge. Joan and Stan were in attendance. It was agreed that the NRP units would be repositioned on to the pavement, which has since happened. One of the neighbourhood services officers contacted colleagues in the City Development Department to again relay community council concerns about road safety due to vans being continually parked there. The traffic engineers replied that their position on this hadn't changed.

He highlighted the road works due to start in Strathern Road on 19th November. On receiving notification of the works he contacted the Roads Maintenance Partnership manager to query what was being done as this section of road had been resurfaced relatively recently. In response he was advised that the surfacing work is further panel patching and compliments the previously completed work. Derek circulated copies of drawings showing the scope of works and diversion routes.

12. Matters raised by members of the public (previously intimated)

None raised prior to the meeting.

13. AOCB

No progress made in creating a development plan which would help clarify the role of the Community Council. Information was shared by the Communities Officer about recent action plan development with Barnhill Tenants and Residents Association which was positive.

The meeting closed at 8.15pm.

14. DONM

The next Ordinary meeting will be on Tuesday 4th December at 7.00pm in Broughty Ferry Library.