

David Gray,
Planning Officer
City Development Dept.,
Dundee City Council,
Dundee House, Floor 6,
N Lindsay St., Dundee,
DD1 1LS

Dr.D.Hewick,
17 Davidson Street,
Broughty Ferry,
Dundee, DD5 3AT.
01382 774288

26 January, 2016

Dear Mr Gray,

**[15/00919/FULL | Demolition of existing building and erection of a newbuild
29No residential apartment building, complete with associated car parking,
landscaping and new access road. | Anton House 5 Forthill Road Broughty
Ferry Dundee DD5 2JT**

We wish to object to the proposal to demolish a statutorily protected Victorian mansion, in reasonable condition for its age (cf Scott Barratt Associates, consulting, civil and structural engineers employed by the applicants), and replace it with a block of flats of a modern design. The proposed main façade is rectangular and wider than that of the original mansion. With four storeys there are also concerns that the new facade will be higher.

Reasons for the objection are detailed below.

1. The contemporary design in a conservation area does not accord with Policy 7 of the Local Plan

Policy 7: High Quality Design

*All development must contribute positively to the quality of the surrounding built and natural environment and should be planned and designed with reference to climate change, mitigation and adaptation. **The modern design does not contribute positively to the built environment of the conservation area.***

*The design and siting of development should respect the character and amenity of the place and should create and improve links within the site and into the surrounding area beyond the site. Proposals should also incorporate new landscape and planting works appropriate to the local context and the scale and nature of the development. **The modern design does not respect the character of the conservation area.***

All proposals should also meet the following design criteria:

- 1) consider and respect site topography and any surrounding important landmarks, views or skylines. **An important landmark will be destroyed.***
- 2) contribute to a sense of identity by developing a coherent structure of streets, spaces, and buildings that are safely accessible, respecting existing building lines where appropriate. **A building that creates a sense of identity will be destroyed***
- 3) the design should complement its surroundings in terms of appearance, height, scale, massing, materials, finishes and colours. **The "contemporary, design features, finishes and materials and finishes" (Applicant's Design Statement) will not complement the character of the conservation area. They will dilute it out.***

4) all buildings, streets, and spaces (including green spaces) should create safe, accessible, inclusive places for people, which are easily navigable, particularly on foot, bicycle and public transport and designed with future adaptability in mind.

5) existing buildings, structures and natural features that contribute to the local townscape should be retained and sensitively integrated into proposals.

A prominent existing building that contributes to the local townscape will not be retained.

There are similar problems with Policy 9 of the Local Plan

Policy 9: Design of New Housing

The design and layout of new housing developments in Dundee should be of a high quality and contribute to creating places that build on and enhance the distinct character and identity of the different parts of the City.

The modern building will help to destroy the 'distinct character and identity' of this historic part of Broughty Ferry.

2. There are concerns that the development will exacerbate a nearby flooding and sewage overload problem (see email communication dated 22.1.16)

3. The new access proposed has negative implications regarding the responsibility for repair of the damaged gate pier of the original entrance (see email communication dated 25.1.16).

4. There is concern that a number of mature or potentially attractive trees will be destroyed (including a Category A tree 789?).

5. Policy 50 of the Local Plan will be contravened

Policy 50: Development In Conservation Areas

*Within conservation areas all development proposals will be expected to preserve or enhance the character of the surrounding area. This will require the retention of all features that contribute to the character and appearance of the conservation area. **The development proposal will not preserve or enhance a conservation area that was made a conservation area with the purpose of primarily protecting its Victorian sandstone and slate buildings.***

Yours sincerely,

D.S. Hewick [Planning Secretary, Broughty Ferry Community Council]