

Mr Paul Macari,
Senior Planning Officer
City Development Dept.,
Dundee City Council,
Dundee House, Floor 6,
N Lindsay St., Dundee,
DD1 1LS

Dr.D.Hewick,
17 Davidson Street,
Broughty Ferry,
Dundee, DD5 3AT.
01382 774288

4 January, 2013

Dear Mr Macari,

Erection of flatted development (16 flats) at 383 Brook Street Broughty Ferry
DD5 2DS (12/00839/FULL) and demolition of a listed building
12/00840/LBC)

We wish to object to this application for the following reasons.

1. The eighteenth century listed cottage should not be demolished. It is a surviving example of local vernacular domestic architecture. Its appearance seems essentially unchanged from when it was listed in 1991.

The three low-level listed buildings at the three corners of the Brook Street/St Vincent Street junction are complementary and the arrangement should not be broken up. It is also important to retain as a group, the 6 listed cottages at 383, 391, 393, 397 Brook Street, and at 158 and 160 St Vincent Street. In addition, the development would destroy the important symmetry of the two south facing facades of the listed buildings on the north corners of the Brook Street/St Vincent Street junction.

It is noted that applicants have been trying to develop the site since at least 2007. Perhaps as a result, the cottage has not been adequately maintained and its condition has been allowed to deteriorate.

The Fabric Report of June 2011 presents a gross exaggeration in terms of supposed structural problems with the cottage. Restoration is perfectly feasible. The current condition of the fabric is not a justification for demolition of a listed building.

We also note that there seems to have been no attempt by the owner to market the cottage as is required in this situation.

2. New flats are not encouraged in Central Broughty Ferry. There is no planning brief, which indicates that there are no site-specific circumstances which require a "flatted solution".

3. The large 4-storey flat roofed building will dominate the streetscape on the north side of Brook Street. It will be an alien presence, completely unsympathetic to the listed and

unlisted neighbouring traditional buildings. The “contemporary profile metal cladding” on most of the exterior surfaces will be particularly inappropriate in this location.

The sheer size of the new building would almost certainly give rise to increased problems of nearby overlooking and overshadowing.

It appears that the development fails to comply with the existing and proposed local plans in terms of space/bedroom requirement and parking provision. We are also concerned about the mention of “external drying systems’ which could result in an unsightly display of drying washing.

4. The increase in residential units from one to 16 will result in a huge increase in car usage which will exacerbate safety, congestion and parking problems associated with a very busy junction.

Yours sincerely,

D.S. Hewick [Planning Secretary, Broughty Ferry Community Council]