

Broughty Ferry Community Council

Minutes of meeting held at Broughty Ferry Library on 6th June, 2017

1. Community Councillors Present: Adele McGrath (Chair);
David A Easson (Treasurer); Joan Chalmers (Minute Secretary);
Neil Cooney (Communications Secretary); John Watson (Planning Secretary);
Stan Nutt (Licensing Secretary) Isobel McLean; Fiona M Potton;
Hugh M Begg; Carolyn Forrester;

In Attendance:

Carole Jenkins (DCC Communities Officer); Marc Winsland (Xplore Dundee);
Janet Wade (Neighbourhood Services DCC)

Ex Officio: Bailie Derek Scott; Cllr Philip Scott; Cllr Craig Duncan

Members of the Public Present: J C Forrester; Jane Begg; Kris Stuart;
Hamish MacPherson; Margaret Stewart; J Johnston; L Murray; C L Delaney;
Doug McLaren

Apologies: Cllr Kevin Cordell; Pat Moore; Sean Moore

2. Minutes of the last meeting of the Community Council

These were agreed to be a true record

Proposed by: John Watson

Seconded by: Isobel McLean

3. Matters arising from the approved Minutes:

There were no matters arising

As we had been notified that Janet Wade had a meeting prior to this one, we took Item 5 first

5. Marc Winsland, Commercial Assistant, Xplore Dundee

Marc began by explaining that Xplore are conducting a full Network Review, rollout to be implemented in September, consultation stage now and that this meeting is just the first of many to be held over the coming weeks across the city.

The main points of relevance to us are a proposal to reduce the frequency of the number 5 to every 10 minutes – this should improve the reliability. Each bus costs £120,000 a year to run so it is not sustainable if the number of buses was to be increased.

Another possible change is to introduce a new service, a number 6, which will run from High Street to Arbroath Road through to Broughty Ferry along Strathern Road, Nursery Road, Strathmore Street and down Guthrie Terrace to Monifieth Road, returning to High Street. This service would run every 15 and would operate in both the morning and afternoon peaks.

We discussed the possibility of various routes and suggested a trial run along the Dundee Road/Broughty Ferry Road (as the 75 does at present) as this route is not served at all other than by the 75 which only runs during the week and finishes before the afternoon peak. There are a lot of older people who may be able to use this service, if it could be relied upon.

Some concerns were raised about the route along Guthrie Terrace but it was explained that the bus used will be the smaller 27 seat vehicle and that a full risk assessment would be carried out. There will not be a bus stop located on Guthrie Terrace.

Marc will take responses from the Community Council and from members of the public: email marc.winsland@nationalexpress.com

Carole Jenkins also highlighted responses through Engage Dundee.

Marc was thanked for coming to our meeting to outline the proposals.

4. Presentation/Q&A – Janet Wade, Neighbourhood Services DCC

Janet explained some of the services and the changes being made throughout the city and that these changes had been driven by Waste Scotland Regulations following the introduction in 2016 by the Scottish Government of proposals to try to ensure that all 32 Local Authorities are using the same bins for recycling. A h

Household Recycling Charter was introduced which means that less household waste should be going to the incinerator or to landfill.

Our paper/card goes to Tealing then Croy

Metals/plastics/cans go to Perth

Glass goes to Newhouse

Food Waste is taken to Glenfarg

Dundee City Council is one of the 16 Councils which have so far signed up to this Charter.

An open discussion followed where the main point raised was to do with the cancellation of the kerbside glass collection and the introduction of the Euro Bins. Despite assertions that consultations were carried out, no members present could recall having been invited to or taken part in a consultation. Presentations had been made but they did not give an opportunity for residents to object to the changes, nor had the Community Council been consulted about these most recent changes.

Members and visitors all asked about the Bring Sites and the distance people had to travel, mainly walking and possibly by older residents and were assured no one should be more than 200m from such a site. The Council also need to take into consideration when siting the bins how they can gain access to empty these. It seems that some are taking up parking spaces or are causing obstructions of sight lines or of pavements. Janet said that local groups could do a walkabout and feed back to DCC if there are any concerns. Hamish MacPherson represents the Clearwater Owners Association and they have already raised concerns with DCC and his report is included here:

Broughty Ferry Community Council

Good evening chair, members and thank you for this opportunity to come and speak to you. Can I introduce myself, as stated my name is Hamish Macpherson and I am the Vice-Chairman of the Clearwater Park Owner's Association representing the households in the Clearwater Park Development. I am accompanied tonight by Kris Stuart, who is the Chair of the Ferryfields Resident Association representing the residents of that development. For clarity Kris and I have never met before this evening but both associations have been in receipt of a number of complaints regarding the recent changes to refuse and recycling kerbside collections in Broughty Ferry and it seemed inefficient to continue to progress separately.

With your patience, I will briefly summarise the issues and then seek your assistance as the statutory body in terms of the Local Government (Scotland) Act, 1973.

In April, 2017, the council made a change to refuse and recycling collections in the Broughty Ferry area. These changes included a cessation of the kerbside collection of glass. This was probably poor timing as it also coincided with a significant increase in council tax for all houses in Clearwater Park and for the majority of households in Broughty Ferry.

As a result, I, and my fellow office bearers, received a flurry of complaints from a number of concerned residents. These have been mirrored by the Ferryfields residents. These complaints were originally focused on three main areas: -

- The removal of council services at the same time as a significant increase in council tax.
- Concern regarding the environmental impact of the change. Many residents were concerned that the cessation of kerbside glass would lead to more glass being disposed of in a traditional manner and ending up in landfill.
- There was a great deal of criticism regarding the inaccuracy of the leaflets sent to residents which stated that the new arrangements were "making recycling easier" and would result in "increased recycling". Residents were concerned that neither will apply to Broughty Ferry residents.

I should state here that I am not an environmental evangelist but due to my role I duly wrote on behalf of my Association to the Local Authority voicing the residents' concerns and suggesting that, if recyclable material separation was required, urging them to consider a "wheeled bin inner caddy" such as used in other local authority areas, to ensure a continuation of kerbside glass collection.

The response was given that "the decision had been made and would not be reconsidered." I reported back to my residents who were frankly unsatisfied with the answer given.

That disappointment however turned to frustration and anger as the new Euro Bins began to appear across Dundee. I produce a photograph at the junction of Balgillo Road and Seafield Road taken last week, you will note the mess

that has appeared around it, and bluntly some areas of Dundee now look like refuse collection centres.

Instead of a number of concerned residents, all attendees at the Association's meeting were vociferous about the imposition of these bins not only in Broughty Ferry but across Dundee. Not only about the effect on the aesthetics of the area but about the inappropriate location. For example, the original one in Balgillo Road East/ Rossie Avenue, which we accept is now moved, impeded prams and wheelchairs from crossing the road. Consultation would have foreseen this issue.

They felt that these "Euro Bins" had been imposed without consultation. I duly wrote again to the Council and was informed that consultation was carried out with the Community Councils, Local Community Planning Partnerships, and in local papers.

However, having researched these press articles at the library they appear to be communication of the decision rather than any attempt at consultation. Accordingly, we seek your guidance as to what consultation was made with respect to the decision. We are obviously also concerned regarding the timing of this consultation, as consultation carried out after the decision was made on 27 June 2016 is of course not consultation but, at best, engagement. I have read the relevant paper submitted to the meeting of the Neighbourhood Service Committee which I have to identify is silent with respect to the aesthetics of the changes. It has appended to it an Equality Impact Assessment but no Community Impact Assessment which I would have expected for such a monumental change to the aesthetics and street scenes of Dundee.

Of note this would be a reasonable expectation under the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act, 2015, which gained royal assent on 24 July, 2015, many months before this paper was presented. I do accept that the community planning aspects of the Act under Part 2 did not come into force until December 2016, but Community Impact Assessments are not by any means a new concept to the local authority or indeed the Dundee Community Planning Partnership, and have been used commissioned frequently for significantly less impactful issues. Undoubtedly the concerns being expressed tonight and filling our local newspapers over preceding weeks could have been foreseen and communicated to the councillors supporting the recommendation, had that due process been followed.

I have to contend that without such an Impact Assessment, the attending councillors approved this recommendation without being presented with all the relevant facts.

Members may wish to ask the Councillors in attendance whether they would have supported these changes in hindsight had they seen the resultant street scenes and level of objection from the communities they serve.

I have no statutory rights in this matter other than that of an officer bearer representing a part of the community but I would urge the Community Council to consider their response to this and their ability at this late stage to work with partner LCPPs and seek to have the council reconsider this significant impact to our communities either through the statutory role under the Local Government Scotland Act, 1973 or indeed through the issuing of a Participation Request in terms of part 3 of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act.

This policy, as can be seen from the photographs, is in danger of giving us national press coverage for the next "Bucket Trail" which will reflect very badly on Broughty Ferry and Dundee and undo much of the excellent work done by bodies such as yourself under the community planning arrangements.

Thank you for your attention.

As time was now running out, it was suggested that members and visitors contact their local Councillors, MSP and MP to raise any concerns they have about this matter

6. Chair's Report

There being no time to discuss this, it was agreed that the Report be included in the minutes.

Welcome everyone. June 17

- (1) I would like to congratulate and welcome along our newly elected Councillors. We look forward to hearing from you a little later.
- (2) Carole has informed us about a new website, 'Information for Community Councils' which has a lot of useful information on it. There are lots of ideas such as Plant a Tree Charters etc., and I will discuss these fully at the next meeting when we have more time.
- (3) The Facebook page continues to run successfully. Once the minutes from tonight are approved and any changes made, I will post these up. Neil and I will meet regularly to discuss the page and see where changes can be made, but if any of you are on FB, it would be ideal if you could share the page and let as many people know about it as possible. I shared Broughty Ferry in Bloom's news, etc., so it is a good way to build relationships within groups in the Ferry too.
- (4) I received an email from the Office Manager from Whitfield Health Centre looking for a few copies of the Broughty Browser, so Neil kindly located these and the centre now have them.

(5) I also received a few emails from Mr Mustafa concerned about the amount of dog litter in the streets of Broughty Ferry. He sent a few pictures and asked me to take immediate action. I asked if he had contacted the Council, but I haven't had a reply. Does anyone consider things to have got worse lately?

(5) Finally, a reminder that our next meeting is on Tuesday 4th July, at 7pm.

There being no further time available, it was agreed to ratify the Planning Secretary's Report (previously circulated) and to accept the Treasurer's Report (previously circulated).

The Licensing Secretary asked that it be noted that letters from DCC are still not being sent to him. This has resulted in us being too late to consider any new proposals for premises in Broughty Ferry. Joan will contact DCC to try to resolve this as soon as possible.

BT will agree to lease the iconic telephone box at Beach Crescent to Broughty Ferry Community Council for £1.00. The proposal is to formally lease it in the first instance and immediately thereafter sub lease it to the BFTA on a full care and maintenance basis.

David will confirm the details of the arrangement and the motion to approve the leasing was proposed by John Watson, seconded by Fiona Potton and approved unanimously.

Note – the wording of the paragraph regarding the telephone box was amended at the meeting on 4th July to read as shown above

The next meeting will be on Tuesday, 4th July 2017 at 7pm.

Meetings are held in Broughty Ferry Library.

The meeting closed at 8.35pm

JC